

International Qurʾānic Studies Association
Studies in the Qurʾān 2

Munʾim Sirry (ed.)

New Trends in Qurʾānic Studies

Text, Context,
and Interpretation

New Trends in Qur'anic Studies

International Qur'anic Studies Association
Studies in the Qur'ān

Series Editor

David S. Powers

Number Two
New Trends in Qur'anic Studies
Text, Context, and Interpretation

Mun'im Sirry, editor

New Trends in Qur'anic Studies
Text, Context, and Interpretation



LOCKWOOD PRESS

Atlanta, Georgia

All rights reserved. No part of this work may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying and recording, or by means of any information storage or retrieval system, except as may be expressly permitted by the 1976 Copyright Act or in writing from the publisher. Requests for permission should be addressed in writing to Lockwood Press, P.O. Box 133289, Atlanta, GA 30333, USA.

© 2019 by Lockwood Press

ISBN: 978-1-948488-18-1

Library of Congress Control Number: 2019940458

Cover design by Susanne Wilhelm

Printed in the United States of America on acid-free paper.

Contents

| | |
|--|------|
| Acknowledgments | vii |
| Contributors | ix |
| Foreword by Reuven Firestone | xiii |
| Notes on Transliteration and Translation | xvi |
| Abbreviations | xvii |

| | |
|---|---|
| Introduction: Recent Trends in Qur'anic Studies — <i>Mun'im Sirry</i> | 1 |
|---|---|

PART 1: TRENDS AND ISSUES IN QUR'ANIC STUDIES

| | |
|---|-----|
| Reflections on the History and Evolution of Western Study of the Qur'ān, from ca. 1900 to the Present — <i>Fred M. Donner</i> | 21 |
| Indonesian Muslim Responses to Non-Muslim Approaches to Qur'anic Studies — <i>Yusuf Rahman</i> | 45 |
| Semitic Rhetoric and the Qur'ān: The Scholarship of Michel Cuypers — <i>Adnane Mokrani</i> | 61 |
| From Clerical to Scriptural Authority: The Qur'ān's Dialogue with the Syriac New Testament — <i>Emran El-Badawi</i> | 83 |
| A Qur'anic Theodicy: Moses in the <i>Sūrat al-Kahf</i> (Q 18) — <i>David Penchansky</i> | 95 |
| Contemporary Shi'i Approaches to the History of the Text of the Qur'ān — <i>Seyfeddin Kara</i> | 109 |
| The Computer and the Qur'ān: An Analysis and Appraisal — <i>Adam Flowers</i> | 125 |

PART 2: TRENDS AND ISSUES IN TAFSĪR STUDIES

| | |
|--|-----|
| Reading the Qur'ān Contextually: Approaches and Challenges — <i>Abdullah Saeed</i> | 151 |
| “Qur'anism” in Modern Qur'ān Interpretation — <i>Izza Rohman</i> | 163 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| Understanding Patriarchal Interpretations of Q 4:34 in the Light of Stanley Fish's "Interpretive Communities" — <i>Adis Duderija</i> | 173 |
| The Global Islamic Tradition and the Nation State in the Contemporary Muslim Exegesis of the Qur'ān — <i>Johanna Pink</i> | 193 |
| Interpreting the Qur'ān between Shari'ah and Changing Custom: On Women's Dress in Indonesia — <i>Munirul Ikhwan</i> | 211 |
| The Hermeneutics of Legitimate Leadership: Qurṭubī's Commentary on Q 2:30 (the Adam Verse) — <i>Han Hsien Liew</i> | 233 |
| "Deviant" Qur'anic Interpretation in Indonesia: Reading Lia Eden's Defense of the Claim to Prophethood — <i>Al Makin</i> | 249 |
| Sufi Commentaries on the Qur'ān in Indonesia: The Poetry of Ḥamzah al-Fanṣūrī and Haji Hasan Mustapa — <i>Jajang A. Rohmana</i> | 261 |
| Bibliography | 279 |
| Subject Index | 305 |

Acknowledgments

The present volume is the fruit of the International Qur'anic Studies Association (IQSA) international conference held in collaboration with the State Islamic University (UIN Sunan Kalijaga) in Yogyakarta, Indonesia (August 4–6, 2015). Without generous support from both institutions, the conference and the publication of this book would not have been possible. A debt of gratitude is owed to the leadership of IQSA for the trust they put in me to organize the first of a series of biennial international conferences. I should mention a few names: Reuven Firestone (then President of IQSA), Gabriel Said Reynolds (Chair of the Board of Directors), Emran El-Badawi (Executive Director) and Daniel A. Madigan (then Chair of the International Programming Committee). Thank you all for your support and advice! I would like to express my deepest gratitude and appreciation to my colleagues at the UIN Sunan Kalijaga in Yogyakarta, especially, Noorhaidi Hasan, Sahiron Syamsuddin, Syafa'atun Almirzanah and Moch Nur Ichwan, who enthusiastically supported the IQSA conference that resulted in the publication of this volume. They deserve all the credit for the success of the Yogyakarta conference.

I also thank the IQSA publications and research committee, especially, David S. Powers (chair of committee), for their encouragement throughout the process of editing this volume. Working closely with Professor Powers has been a rewarding experience. His judicious corrections and insightful suggestions have immeasurably improved each essay in this volume. Thank you, David, for your thoroughness and careful attention to detail! I am grateful to G. R. Hawting (then chair of IQSA publications and research committee) for his untiring support and guidance. A special thanks goes to the contributors to this volume, who have displayed patience and good cheer over the lengthy period of time between the conference and final product, and to all of the conference participants whose papers—mostly by their own choice—are not included in this volume. I would also like to thank the Institute for Scholarship in the Liberal Arts (ISLA) at Notre Dame for its support. Last but not least, grateful acknowledgment is made here to those who continue to support IQSA as a new learned society. As the current chair of the International Programming Committee, I encourage my colleagues, wherever you are, to become members of IQSA and to participate in our conferences.

Contributors

Emran El-Badawi is associate professor of Middle Eastern studies at the University of Houston in Houston, Texas. His publications include *The Qurʾān and the Aramaic Gospel Traditions* (2013; repr. 2016); “Al-baḥṭh ‘an al-siyāq al-qurʾānī – nabdhah ‘an al-dirāsāt al-Qurʾāniyyah al-ḥadīthah,” *al-Machreq* (2014); “The impact of Aramaic (especially Syriac) on the Qurʾān,” *Religion Compass* (2014); and “From ‘Clergy’ to ‘Celibacy’: The Development of Rahbāniyyah between Qurʾān, Ḥadīth and Church Canon,” *al-Bayān: Journal of Qurʾān and Ḥadīth Studies* (2013).

Fred M. Donner is professor of Near Eastern History at the University of Chicago in Chicago, Illinois. His publications include *Muhammad and the Believers: At the Origins of Islam* (2010); “The Historian, the Believers, and the Qurʾān,” in *New Perspectives on the Qurʾān* (2011); and “The Qurʾanicization of Religio-Political Discourse in the Umayyad Period,” *Révue des Mondes Musulmans et de la Méditerranée* (2011).

Adis Duderija is lecturer in Islam and Society in the School of Humanities, Languages and Social Science at Griffith University, Australia. His publications include *The Imperatives of Progressive Islam* (2017); *Constructing Religiously Ideal “Believer” and “Muslim Woman” Concepts: Neo-Traditional Salafi and Progressive Muslim Methods of Interpretation* (2011); and “Toward a Scriptural Hermeneutics of Islamic Feminism,” *Journal of Feminist Studies in Religion* (2015).

Adam Flowers is a PhD candidate in the Department of Near Eastern Languages and Civilizations at the University of Chicago in Chicago, Illinois. His primary research interests include the history of the Qurʾān text and genres of qurʾanic discourse.

Munirul Ikhwan is lecturer at the Graduate School of the State Islamic University (UIN Sunan Kalijaga) in Yogyakarta, Indonesia. His publications include *An Indonesian Initiative to Make the Qurʾān Down-to-Earth: Muhammad Quraish Shihab and His School of Exegesis* (2015); “Fi Taḥaddī al-dawlah: ‘al-Tarjamah al-tafsīriyyah’ fī muwājahat al-khiṭāb al-dīnī al-rasmī li’l-dawlah,” *Journal of Qurʾanic Studies* (2015); and “Western Studies of Qurʾanic Narratives: From the Historical Orientation into the Literary Analysis,” *al-Jamīʿah* (2010).

Seyfeddin Kara is assistant professor of Shiʿi studies and Relations between Islamic Schools of Thought at Hartford Seminary in Connecticut. His publications include “The Suppression of ‘Alī ibn Abī Ṭālib’s Codex: Study of

the Traditions (*Aḥādīth*) on the Earliest Copy of the Qur'ān," *Journal of Near Eastern Studies* (2016); "Use of Transmission Patterns in Contemporary Shi'ite *Ḥadīth* Studies," *Journal of Shia Islamic Studies* (2016); and "The Collection of the Qur'ān in the Early Shi'ite Discourse: The Traditions Ascribed to the Fifth Imām Abū Ja'far Muḥammad al-Bāqir," *Journal of the Royal Asiatic Society* (2015).

Han Hsien Liew is a postdoctoral fellow at Harvard University in Cambridge, Massachusetts. His dissertation is titled "Piety, Knowledge, and Rulership in Medieval Islam: Ibn al-Jawzī's Ameliorative Politics," and his publications include "The Caliphate of Adam: Theological Politics of the Qur'ānic Term *Ḥalīfa*," *Arabica* (2016); and "Ibn al-Jawzī and the Cursing of Yazīd b. Mu'āwiya: A Debate on Rebellion and Legitimate Rulership," *Journal of the American Oriental Society* (forthcoming).

Al Makin is professor of Islamic studies at the State Islamic University (UIN) Sunan Kalijaga in Yogyakarta, Indonesia. His publications include *Challenging Islamic Orthodoxy: Accounts of Lia Eden and Other Prophets in Indonesia* (2016); "Unearthing Nusantra's Concept of Religious Pluralism," *Al-Jami'ah: Journal of Islamic Studies* (2016); and "Pluralism versus Islamic Orthodoxy," in *Social Justice and Rule of Law: Addressing the Growth of a Pluralist Indonesian Democracy* (2011).

Adnane Mokrani is associate professor of Islamic studies at the Pontifical Institute for Arabic and Islamic studies in Rome, Italy. His publications include "Al-tajribah al-dīniyyah wa'l-naṣṣ," in *al-Naṣṣ al-kitābī wa'l-naṣṣ al-qur'ānī: al-tashakkul wa'l-haqīqah* (2011); *Nazarāt al-masīḥiyyīn al-lubnāniyyīn li'l-'alāqāt al-islāmiyyah al-masīḥiyyah* (2010); *Leggere il Corano a Roma* (2010); and *Naqd al-adyān 'inda Ibn Ḥazm al-Andalusī* (2008).

David Penchansky is emeritus professor of Hebrew Bible at the University of St. Thomas in St. Paul, Minnesota. His publications include *Understanding Wisdom Literature: Conflict and Dissonance in the Hebrew Text* (2012); *Twilight of the Gods: Polytheism in the Hebrew Bible* (2005); *What Rough Beast? Images of God in the Hebrew Bible* (1999); and *The Politics of Biblical Theology: A Post-Modern Reading* (1995).

Johanna Pink is professor of Islamic studies at the University of Freiburg, Germany. Her publications include *Muslim Qur'ānic Interpretation Today: Media, Genealogies and Interpretive Communities* (2019); "Translations of the Qur'ān in Muslim Majority Contexts," a special issue of *Journal of Qur'anic Studies* (2015); and *Sunnitischer Tafīr in der modernen islamischen Welt* (2011).

Yusuf Rahman is professor of Islamic studies at the State Islamic University (UIN) Syarif Hidayatullah in Jakarta, Indonesia. His publications include "Indonesian Muslim Responses to the Use of Hermeneutics in the Study of the Qur'ān and *Tafīr*: A Critical Assessment," in *Qur'anic Studies in Contempo-*

rary Indonesia (2015); and “The Qur’ān as Literature: Literary Interpretation of the Qur’ān,” *Journal of Qur’ān and Hadīth Studies* (2014).

Izza Rohman is lecturer at the Universitas Muhammadiyah Prof. Dr. Hamka in Jakarta, Indonesia. His publications include “The Pursuit of New Interpretive Approaches to the Qur’ān in Contemporary Indonesia,” in *The Qur’ān in the Malay-Indonesian World: Context and Interpretation* (2016); “New Approach in Interpreting the Qur’ān in Contemporary Indonesia,” *Studia Islamika* (2014); and “Intra-Qur’anic Connections in Sunni and Shi’i Tafsirs: A Meeting Point or Another Area of Contestation?” *The Indonesian Journal of Islam and Muslim Societies* (2013).

Jajang A. Rohmana is associate professor of Islamic studies at the State Islamic University (UIN) Sunan Gunung Djati in Bandung, Indonesia. His publications include “Al-Qur’ān wa’l-isti’mār: Radd al-Shaykh al-ḥajj Aḥmad Sanūsī (1888–1950) ‘alā’l-isti’mār min khilāl tafsīr al-malja’ al-ṭālibīn,” *Studia Islamika* (2015); and “Sundanese Sufi Literature and Local Islamic Identity: A Contribution of Haji Hasan Mustapa’s Dangding,” *al-Jami’ah: Journal of Islamic Studies* (2012).

Abdullah Saeed is professor of Arab and Islamic studies at the University of Melbourne, Australia. His publications include *Reading the Qur’ān in the Twenty-First Century: A Contextualist Approach* (2013); *Interpreting the Qur’ān: Towards a Contemporary Approach* (2005); and “Some Reflections on the Contextualist Approach to Ethico-Legal Texts of the Qur’ān,” *Bulletin of the School of Oriental and African Studies* (2008).

Mun’im Sirry is assistant professor of theology at the University of Notre Dame in Indiana. His publications include “Other Religions,” in *The Blackwell Companion to the Qur’ān*, 2nd ed. (2017); “Reinterpreting the Qur’anic Criticism of Other Religions,” in *Qur’anic Studies Today* (2016); and *Scriptural Polemics: The Qur’ān and Other Religions* (2014).

Foreword

In 2009, when addressing a conference of Muslim and non-Muslim scholars engaged in critical studies of the Qur'ān at the University of Notre Dame, Professor Abdolkarim Soroush remarked, “what a shame it is that conferences of this kind are not held in Islamic countries, and are unlikely to be for the foreseeable future, because they would not be welcomed by Muslims.”¹ Professor Soroush is rightly recognized as one of the most influential intellectuals in the Muslim world today. But his remark proves that brilliance does not a prophet make. The year 2009 was only five years before the incorporation of the International Qur'anic Studies Association (IQSA), which held its first international conference on critical studies of the Qur'ān the following year in Indonesia, the largest Muslim country by population in the world. The essays in this volume derive from that conference.

Indonesia was a fitting locale for this historic 2015 conference. Apart from having the largest Muslim population in the world, Indonesian Muslims are extraordinarily diverse, both religiously and culturally, and many other religions are practiced there. What is more, Indonesia's secular national government does not generally interfere with religious practice. Jogjakarta, the locale for this conference, is a renowned center of education (*kota pelajar*) and culture with an impressive mix of traditional and modern schools and approaches to learning. The fact that the State Islamic University (UIN) Sunan Kalijaga was the local host for this conference is particularly appropriate, as this university has been the country's leading center for studies of vernacular Islam, state-Islam relations, and contemporary social change in Muslim societies. Here is a respected Islamic university located in a Muslim country engaging in critical study of the Qur'ān!

The phrase “critical study of the Qur'ān” merits consideration, since it has come to mean in some quarters the *criticism* of the Qur'ān with the purported goal of denigrating it and reducing its standing as a sacred text. “Criticism” carries a sense of disapproval or disparagement, an unfortunate misreading of the term as I use it here. In critical studies the term signifies the exercise of judicious evaluation of an object or idea examined, and it includes the questioning of all assumptions. Perhaps the most appropriate synonym would be

1. Gabriel Said Reynolds (ed.), *New Perspective on the Qur'ān: The Qur'ān in Its Historical Context 2* (London: Routledge, 2011), xvii.

“analytical.” Analytical perspectives have been applied to the Qur’ān since its emergence as a text in the seventh century CE. The earliest critical study of the Qur’ān was made by Companions of the Prophet who asked him questions about the meaning of the revelation he announced. The Companions would not hold back from questioning his answers, and subsequent Muslim commentators have continued in their footsteps by applying critical analytical methods in a wide variety of literary, linguistic, and historical explorations of the qur’anic text. Muslim scholars have often adjusted their approaches to the Qur’ān in response to contemporary developments, and a certain level of openness to new methods among traditional Muslim scholars continues to this day.

Methodologies and perspectives have continued to evolve. What has changed with respect to the critical study of the Qur’ān is not only the particular modes of analysis (historical, religious, intellectual), but also the tools that scholars apply to it. Researchers are influenced by many factors: developments in science and technology, changes in the languages we speak, and new ideas that inevitably arise from exchanges between people. These factors have an impact on our assumptions as readers, not only in relation to the Qur’ān, but also in relation to the entire world that we are constantly “reading,” a term that aptly describes the way we process and make sense of the world around us. Reading is interpretive because we “read ourselves” into whatever it is that we read. Whenever we read, we interpret, but because we are all different, the interpretive products of our reading will differ as well. This certainly applies to reading the Qur’ān.

That we differ, one may argue, is a divinely wrought reality (Q 5:48, 49:13). But whatever our perspective on the source of human disagreement, it is impossible to deny that we humans differ over our reading of almost everything. Difference is inevitable, and the nature of difference is such that it often causes discomfort that can lead to discord. Such is the nature of the human condition. Disagreement, however, can also bring illumination. Since we are destined to differ, let us learn and grow from our differences so that we may understand more fully the subtleness of the universe.

The series of essays in this collection reflect an earnest and intellectually honest effort to learn and grow from our diverse perspectives and approaches to qur’anic studies. They employ a range of methodologies: historical, rhetorical, juridical, and theological. One of the most striking aspects of this remarkable collection is the conversation between and among its authors. The conversation begins, for example, with an essay by Fred M. Donner on the history and evolution of the study of the Qur’ān in the West in the modern period. That essay is followed by Yusuf Rahman’s study of Indonesian Muslims’ responses to outsiders’ studies of the Qur’ān and *tafsīr*.

Like all sacred scriptures, the Qur’ān presents itself as an eternal message. And like all sacred scriptures, it reflects the particularities of its historical

context. The extraordinarily complex meanings of the Qur'ān are knowable most fully when it is studied in two directions. In addition to its historical context, the Qur'ān looks back to the past in its references to ancient times, while it also considers what will or might come in the future. It reflects antecedent literatures, both oral and written, that provide the linguistic and ideational context for the articulation of its message. It then becomes a focus for reflection in the record of its reception in commentaries, theological treatises, juridical decisions, and even folklore.

This collection includes studies in both directions. Looking back in history, Emran El-Badawi writes on what he perceives as a dialogue between the Qur'ān and the New Testament in its Semitic, Syriac articulation. Other essays consider Shi'i approaches to the history of the qur'anic text, and the use of computers in its textual analysis. The full assemblage contains a broad range of studies, from an examination of shifting Indonesian responses to women's attire, to Indonesian Sufi commentaries, to strategies of qur'anic reading and interpretation ranging from early legal to contemporary qur'anist commentaries.

The perspectives offered in this collection extend broadly from the traditional to the post-postmodern. They naturally differ, and it is precisely these differences that deepen and strengthen the discipline. As we learn broadly from one another, our exchange advances our knowledge. Such a course of engagement draws closer to a truth that will, of course, ultimately elude full understanding. As in so many things, the satisfaction lies in the process.

Reuven Firestone
Regenstein Professor in Medieval Judaism and Islam
Hebrew Union College, California, USA

Notes on Transliteration and Translation

Transliteration style follows the guidelines of the *Journal of the International Qur'anic Studies Association (JIQSA)*. Long vowels are represented by \bar{a} for the *alif*, \bar{i} for the *yā'*, and \bar{u} for the *wāw*. *Tā' marbūtah* is rendered “h” (e.g., *sūrah*), except in construct, where it becomes “at” (e.g., *sūrat al-Baqarah*). With regard to references to scriptures, the following conventions have been adopted: Qur'ān (uppercase with transliteration); qur'anic (lowercase without transliteration); Bible (uppercase); and biblical (lowercase). Individual contributors used different translations of the Qur'ān into English, according to personal preference; some have used his or her own translation or modified a published Qur'ān translation.

Abbreviations

General

| | |
|------------------------|---|
| AH | anno Hegirae |
| ca. | circa |
| ch(s). | chapter(s) |
| <i>EI</i> ² | <i>Encyclopaedia of Islam</i> . 2nd ed. 11 vols. Leiden: Brill, 1954–2002. |
| <i>EQ</i> | <i>Encyclopaedia of the Qur'ān</i> . Edited by Jane Dammen McAuliffe. 5 vols. Leiden: Brill, 2001–2006. |
| IAIN | Institut Agama Islam Negeri |
| IDEO | Dominican Institute for Oriental Studies |
| IIUM | International Islamic University Malaysia |
| ISIS | Islamic State in Iraq and Syria |
| MUI | Majelis Ulama Indonesia |
| n(n). | note(s) |
| NRSV | New Revised Standard Version |
| PCA | Principal Component Analysis |
| RBS | International Society for the Study of Biblical and Semitic Rhetoric |
| SRA | Semitic rhetorical analysis |
| Syr. | Syriac |
| TQbQ | <i>tafsīr al-Qur'ān bi'l-Qur'ān</i> |

Ancient Sources

| | |
|-------------|---------|
| <i>Did.</i> | Didache |
|-------------|---------|